

## Alan Lewis

---

**To:** Mario Reale  
**Subject:** RE: IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

A few brief notes from our meeting last week – juts to keep track of events, I meant to send them earlier.

Update on outstanding actions  
-----

- TNC Meeting plans  
Review and adapt (if necessary) invite email  
Alan to check status of meeting preparation with Steffie  
Mario to put together contacts document for invitees to the meeting  
Alan to check this list against GEANT partner relations to see if any additions/changes are needed, also check with Brook and Tom  
Other contact suggestions - South America/Australia  
Alan aim to send invite out on Monday 20/5

MVP document  
-----

- Mario to update based on review comments

Business case template  
-----

We reviewed the template Alan put together.

- Need to add a benefits section;
- Where to put the option of providing a bundled solution;
- Need to add the rationale and explain WHY GEANT should do this as opposed to NRENS.

Best regards

Alan

**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

**GÉANT**  
Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People  
Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.

---

**From:** Alan Lewis  
**Sent:** 14 May 2019 16:52

**To:** Mario Reale <mario.reale@garr.it>

**Subject:** RE: IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

Here are some brief notes from our last call. We referred to the canvas, but did not update it this time.

Update on outstanding actions  
-----

### Segments

- Alan/Mario - Review current NREN offering in the IdP-as-a-Service area  
I am chasing to get some feedback from the GEANT partner relations team
- Alan - GEANT offering directly to HOs as they may be few optional interested NRENS in Europe  
Probably not a viable way forward – feedback from Maarten, Licia, Marina etc – still waiting some feedback from International relations team
- Alan – Follow up conversation with SWITCH re. possible outsourcing with other NRENS  
Discussing possible contacts with partner relations also at our TNC meeting. Need to keep big picture of persistent Id vs. Federated in mind,  
will feds become attribute authority? Is hub and spoke architecture a more likely model than full mesh?
- Alan/Mario - TNC meeting plans  
Mario to draft list of attendees and invite email – assume 20- 25 attendees  
Mario will not be attending so ask Niels to co-chair meeting with Alan – he has agreed to do this  
Address technical more business orientated audience  
Put together agenda and materials and send out in advance to be most productive  
Plan to use Rome F2F to work on this  
Need presentations on the two platform options, Draft 'strawman' proposal for MVP  
Seek opinions on best trade-offs
- Mario – Enhance IdP-as-a-Service presentation material  
Ongoing – also material from Tamas
- Mario – Understand the offering and cost model that TIER provide  
Unable to attend call on 7/5 planning to attend next call on 21/5  
Ref: <http://www.internet2.edu/acamp>

### Channels

- Mario – Discuss possibility of outsourcing a branded offering to the NRENS and also other WGs as a channel  
Setup call with Davide
- Alan – Discuss with NRENS re working to provide the offering as a part of eduGAIN  
Outstanding

LHS canvas  
-----

### Activities

- Mario – Update MVP document to be used as initial 'strawman' for offering

### Costs

- Mario – Discuss costs with Tamas;
- Alan – Find costs for GEANT infrastructure  
Mario – Find hardware costs
- Operational costs – c.w eduTEAMS (say)
- Support costs
- Mario – Find previous Excel files with costs in case this is helpful.

Next steps  
-----

We agreed to put together a template for the final business strategy document that the canvas will inform. We can work on this further and at the F2F in Rome.

- Alan – Put document template together

Let me know if I missed anything.

Best regards

Alan

**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

#### **GÉANT**

Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People  
Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.

---

**From:** Alan Lewis  
**Sent:** 08 May 2019 14:25  
**To:** Mario Reale <[mario.reale@garr.it](mailto:mario.reale@garr.it)>  
**Subject:** RE: IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

Sorry these notes are a little late – busy (and short week due to the bank holiday) . On the call we looked at the status of the actions raised on the last call and then at the LHS of the canvas, which is primarily concerned with how we create value. I have updated the business canvas with some further comments and highlighted in green the current areas of focus that we see as the priority. We probably need to be thinking about a phased set of functionality since we will not now everything we need at the outset and will need to get feedback from the community to define the direction of the roadmap. This is the fourth meeting to discuss the canvas and we have now covered all the areas. I suggest perhaps another couple of discussions are needed to iterate around the information we have followed by a F2F meeting to extract the information into a draft business strategy document that we can present to the team and will form a key output of the Incubators task.

Actions update  
-----

#### **Segments**

- Alan/Mario - Review current NREN offering in the IdP-as-a-Service area.  
I have discussed this with GEANT partner relations- but no feedback yet.
- Alan - GEANT offering directly to HO's as they may be few optional interested NRENS in Europe  
Initial discussion with GEANT partner relations. Posed question to WP5 T4 (Outreach) Maarten Kremers – awaiting feedback.  
Also discussing with GEANT International relations team for broader (outside Europe) view.
- Alan – Follow up conversation with SWITCH re. possible outsourcing with other NRENS  
Outstanding – discussing with GEANT partner relations.  
Also need to consider the effect of persistent academic ID solutions such as ORCID, EduID etc.  
Also consider whether different operational integration requirements from NRENS will make offering a single solution difficult.

- Alan – Discuss the possibility of workshop attendance to gather requirements from NRENS and test MVP proposal and business models  
Workshop not possible, but side-meeting arranged at TNC on the Monday at the same time as the Lightening Talk sessions  
Need to identify and contact attendees, and plan content for the meeting.
- Mario – Enhance IdP-as-a-Service presentation material  
On-going – we need to have material in place for the TNC meeting  
Check what Tamas may already have that can be used
- Mario – Understand the offering and cost model that TIER provide  
Follow up at the IdP-as-a- Service WG call on 7/5

## Channels

- Mario – Discuss possibility of outsourcing a branded offering to the NRENS and also other WGs as a channel  
Plan to arrange call with Davide w/c 13/5
- Alan – Discuss with NRENS re working to provide the offering as a part of eduGAIN  
Outstanding

LHS of canvas  
-----

## Activities

What is required in order for us to complete the offering?

How do we compare the two solutions that we have?

Compare at the end of the Incubator cycle.

Further work is needed on our original platform and a roadmap of features exists.

Roadmap for SAML.IO less clear

Document describing MVP needs to be completed and will form the main requirements document. This needs to capture the functional and non-functional requirements and map these to what the two offerings provide with a gap analysis to define what is needed for the MVP.

## Resources

What is unique about the offering(s) that we have?

Technical, deployment method, bundled consultancy, bundling with FaaS.

Need to identify this.

## Partners

Working directly or via the NRENS?

Needs further discussion.

## Costs

Can we calculate sunk costs for IdP-as-Service in GN42?

Need to work out some rough order of magnitude costs to identify what revenue model (if any) will be needed.

Infrastructure costs – makes some simple assumptions:

Cost of infrastructure/user – VM cost

Integration costs – Assume the same for each user (but could vary widely as suggested by Thomas I @

SWITCH)

Assume market == 10 small NRENS + 100 HOs (direct) + 10 Large NRENS (outsource) (say)

Sum these to find total costs

Mario – Discuss costs with Tamas;

Alan – Find costs for GEANT infrastructure

Mario – Find hardware costs

Operational costs – c.w eduTEAMS (say)

Support costs

Mario – Find previous Excel files with costs in case this is helpful.

Best regards

Alan

**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

**GÉANT**

Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People

Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.

---

**From:** Alan Lewis  
**Sent:** 12 April 2019 11:57  
**To:** Mario Reale <[mario.reale@garr.it](mailto:mario.reale@garr.it)>  
**Subject:** RE: IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

Thanks for you time on the call yesterday. I've made some comments on the business canvas and I'll upload it onto the WIKI (assuming we have a WIKI) as soon as I can. I'll also update so it is a bit clearer now we have had some further discussion, but I might not get a chance to do this before I go away on holiday. Here are some notes on the topic we covered.

Segments

-----

A number of NRENS are offering a similar service within their community (AMRES,CESNET,SWITCH,HEANET,RENATER,JISC, TIER). Most of these are offering a service either paid or free but one TIER is offering a download bundle (although they are discussing plans for a service). There may be others so it would be good to check the current situation.

**Mario/Alan review current NREN offerings**

How many NRENS (small and of limited capability ) does that leave. We agreed probably not many. Just the candidates who currently use FaaS (around 7) and may one or two more. So can we also offer the service direct to HO in areas where there is no provision at present? I am discussing with partner relations at GEANT to get their view on this.

**Alan discuss partner relations view on direct HO approaches**

Can we also offer to larger NRENS where we can offer a more cost effective or more highly valuable service (say eduroam and eduGAIN IdPs)? I am talking with SWITCH (Thomas Lengenhager) on this.

**Alan follow up on conversation with SWITCH and other larger NRENS**

If the above are possible then our total market would be:

Total = (Number of small NRENS no offering the service) +(HO in areas where there is no service offering) +( Larger NRENS who may want to outsource their service).

This is focused on Europe and does not consider other potential interest their might be from the U.S or RoW.

We agreed we need to get a better view of the potential uptake but engaging with some of these organisations. One way might be via a workshop. Partner relations are planning a GEANT service workshop in May and I will see if we can use this event.

**Alan discuss possibility of engaging in partner workshop**

We would need some better materials to describe the solution and cover potential issues such as GDPR, together with a demo (if possible) of our MVP solution.

**Mario look at enhancing presentation material for the platform**

Another useful data point on uptake would be to discuss with TIER how many users the TIER sw offering has, and what the cost model is.

**Mario to discuss with TIER to try and get this information.**

Channels  
-----

In areas where there is no NREN offering to HOs we discussed that GEANT might be offer directly to HOs.

In addition we could offer a branded service for NRENS to offer to their HOs.

Another possibility is to see if we can offer via eduGAIN (in a similar way to Managed IdP being offered by eduroam). Possibly this IdP service could be a link between eduroam and eduGAIN? I have spoken to Lukas about this, but we should also speak to Davide.

**Mario to arrange call with Davide on 24/4?**

There may also be other WGs e.g REFEDS we can use as a channel.

**Alan discuss GEANT partner relations views on direct contact with NRENS?**

Relationships  
-----

We identified as above working with eduGAIN. We also agreed it would be useful to identify some target NRENS to discuss with.

Revenue  
-----

Not discussed but we should agree the principles – cover costs, maximise uptake, self-sustaining.

The final definition of the MVP will to an extent depend on what we discover as our target customers. Outsourcing of larger NREN services may require greater capability.

Next time we will focus on the LHS of the canvas. Once we have iterated the whole thing a F2F would be useful to work on the output document.

Best regards

Alan

**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

**GÉANT**  
Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People  
Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.

---

**From:** Alan Lewis

**Sent:** 04 April 2019 15:33

**To:** Mario Reale <[mario.reale@garr.it](mailto:mario.reale@garr.it)>

**Subject:** RE: IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

Although we didn't directly use the canvas today I think we covered a lot of the areas around 'Customers and Revenues' that we planned to discuss and I'll add these to the comments and update on the WIKI.

Here in brief is my understanding of what we covered:

1) Targets for the offering

- a. Main target is platform lifecycle management for federations wishing to provide a cloud hosted solution;
- b. A hosted service from NRENS and/or GEANT is also possible but is a more difficult proposition;
- c. A secondary target is for HO admins wishing to manage their own IdP. This could be by a delegation model to the platform;
- d. Providing a GUI to the Ansible toolkit to allow configuration of IdPs on premises is out of scope of the platform but could be considered in task 1.

2) Costs and cost benefit

At this point in the analysis we don't spent to much time on a detailed analysis of the cost of offering the service because:

- a. The model we adopt will dictate how much detail we need to go into to determine costs. e.g if we provide the source freely we don't want to waste time on such an analysis;
- b. There are many variables and assumptions and arriving at a figure will be difficult to address now. We may need to return to this later.

3) Alternative of substitutional offerings

As yet not aware of any substitutional or disruptive offerings that would render the current approach invalid. A number of NRENS (GRNET, SWITCH, CESNET, RENATER etc. and commercial providers have offerings in this area. It would be useful to understand for these offerings:

- a. Features;
- b. Uptake (but difficult for the commercial offerings);
- c. Pricing (or business model);
- d. Any issues (e.g. GDPR).

Revisit the Marketing Analysis done previously to update and add to the information on the points above. This will help us to validate what our MVP should be.

4) Offering considerations

- a. A SW solution as opposed to a service might be harder to push adoption of but the offering could include on-premise technical support/consultancy. This might not scale well;
- b. Involving the target adopters as stakeholders in the development might encourage adoption (as was the hope in GN4-2), but may be hard to achieve in practice;
- c. Currently we have two potential implementations – Campus IdP platform and SAMLIdP.io. We will need to decide how to progress, and what constraints we have in development, but need to clarify the requirements before we can do this.
- d. We might consider a bundled offering (say IdP and eduroam) in order to differentiate and make the offering more attractive.

Next time we can address the RHS of the canvas in more detail and think about the revenue (or lack of) side of things.

I would estimate a couple more iterations before we have a more concrete direction.

We may want to consider a F2F session for a day or two in the future to advance quickly on the details.

Best regards

Alan

**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

**GÉANT**

Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People  
Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.

---

**From:** Alan Lewis  
**Sent:** 02 April 2019 10:46  
**To:** Mario Reale <[mario.reale@garr.it](mailto:mario.reale@garr.it)>  
**Subject:** IdP as a Service Business Canvas

Hello Mario,

I think we have begun a useful discussion to try and work out the possible business models for the IdP as a Service activity. I have uploaded the canvas we are using to the WIKI with the comments I captured on the 'Value Propositions' section.

Here in brief is what I think we agreed:

- 1) The key problem we are solving is for institutions who don't have the capability to join a federation since they cannot setup and operate an identity provider;
- 2) The value proposition is captured by the statement 'Identity without the effort' (although it could be stated better);
- 3) The scope of the solution (platform) we can offer is centred on identity, integration with federation capability is functional and outside scope;
- 4) The platform is focused on offering cloud-based IdP to institutions either directly or via an NREN or GEANT;
- 5) The exact nature of the delivery mechanism (service or software solution) is to be determined;
- 6) We believe we have sufficient evidence from the survey to confirm this is a real need – even though some time has passed since the survey.

It would be useful to see what similar solutions exist that could meet the need or if a different approach has made this solution unnecessary;

Next time we can work through the right-hand side of the canvas to look at the customer and revenue side of things.

If you have any thoughts before we next meet we can discuss on email or slack.

I'm not sure if you have everything covered for the end of Sprint demo, but if you are short of things to show one thing we could show and explain is what we are doing with the business canvas. It's not a technical demo, but it might help people understand the thought process that is going on.

Best regards

Alan



**Alan Lewis**  
**Trust and Identity Services Product Manager**

**GÉANT**

Direct Tel: +44 (0)1223 371409  
Mobile: +44 (0) 7500 891616  
Switchboard: +44 (0)1223 371300

Networks • Services • People

Learn more at [www.geant.org](http://www.geant.org)

GÉANT Vereniging (Association) is registered with the Chamber of Commerce in Amsterdam with registration number 40535155 and operates in the UK as a branch of GÉANT Vereniging. Registered office: Hoekenrode 3, 1102BR Amsterdam, The Netherlands. UK branch address: City House, 126-130 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PQ, UK.